

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO

PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA	)	
ex rel. DANIEL E. LUNGREN, ATTORNEY	)	<b>Case No. J.C.C.P. 4041</b>
GENERAL OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA;	)	
S. KIMBERLY BELSHE, DIRECTOR OF	)	(Sacramento Superior
HEALTH SERVICES OF THE STATE OF	)	Court Case No.
CALIFORNIA,	)	97AS03031)
	)	
Plaintiffs,	)	
	)	<b>CONSENT DECREE</b>
v.	)	<b>and</b>
	)	<b>FINAL JUDGMENT</b>
PHILIP MORRIS, INC.; R.J. REYNOLDS	)	<b>WITH RESPECT TO</b>
TOBACCO COMPANY; BROWN & WILLIAMSON	)	<b>SMOKELESS TOBACCO</b>
TOBACCO CORPORATION; B.A.T INDUSTRIES,	)	<b>MASTER SETTLEMENT</b>
P.L.C.; BRITISH AMERICAN TOBACCO	)	<b>AGREEMENT</b>
COMPANY; LORILLARD TOBACCO COMPANY,	)	
INC.; AMERICAN TOBACCO COMPANY, INC.;	)	
UNITED STATES TOBACCO COMPANY; HILL &	)	
KNOWLTON, INC.; THE COUNCIL FOR TOBACCO	)	
RESEARCH-U.S.A.,INC.; TOBACCO INSTITUTE,	)	
INC.; SMOKELESS TOBACCO COUNCIL, INC.	)	
and DOES 1-200, inclusive,	)	
	)	
Defendants.	)	
	)	

**WHEREAS**, Plaintiffs, the People of the State of California and S. Kimberly Belshe, Director of Health Services of the State of California, commenced this action on June 12, 1997, by and through their attorney, Attorney General Daniel E. Lungren, pursuant to his common law powers and the provisions of California law;

**WHEREAS**, Plaintiffs filed their First Amended Complaint on August 29, 1997;

**WHEREAS**, the State of California asserted various claims for monetary, equitable and injunctive relief on behalf of the State of California against United States Tobacco Company and other defendants;

**WHEREAS**, defendant United States Tobacco Company has contested the claims in the State's Complaint and First Amended Complaint and denied the State's allegations;

**WHEREAS**, the parties desire to resolve this action in a manner which appropriately addresses the State's public health concerns, while conserving the parties' resources, as well as those of the Court, which would otherwise be expended in litigating a matter of this magnitude;

**WHEREAS**, the Court has made no determination of any violation of law, this Consent Decree and Final Judgment With Respect to Smokeless Tobacco Master Settlement Agreement ("Consent Decree and Final Judgment") being entered prior to the taking of any testimony and without trial or final adjudication of any issue of fact or law.

**NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED, AS FOLLOWS:**

#### **I. JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action and over each of the Participating Manufacturers. Venue is proper in San Diego County.

## **II. DEFINITIONS**

The definitions set forth in the Smokeless Tobacco Master Settlement Agreement dated November 23, 1998, (hereafter referred to as "Agreement" or "STMSA"; a copy of which is attached hereto as Exhibit A) are incorporated herein by reference and words defined therein are signified herein by being capitalized.

## **III. APPLICABILITY**

A. This Consent Decree and Final Judgment applies only to the Participating Manufacturers in their corporate capacity acting through their respective successors and assigns, directors, officers, employees, agents, subsidiaries, divisions, or other internal organizational units of any kind or any other entities acting in concert or participation with them. The remedies, penalties and sanctions that may be imposed or assessed in connection with a violation of this Consent Decree and Final Judgment (or any order issued in connection herewith) shall only apply to the Participating Manufacturers, and shall not be imposed or assessed against any employee, officer or director of any Participating Manufacturer, or against any other person or entity as a consequence of such violation, and there shall be no jurisdiction under this Consent Decree and Final Judgment to do so.

B. This Consent Decree and Final Judgment is not intended to and does not vest standing in any third party with respect to the terms hereof. No portion of this Consent Decree and Final

Judgment shall provide any rights to, or be enforceable by, any person or entity other than the State of California or a Released Party. The State of California may not assign or otherwise convey any right to enforce any provision of this Consent Decree and Final Judgment.

#### **IV. VOLUNTARY ACT OF THE PARTIES**

The parties hereto expressly acknowledge and agree that this Consent Decree and Final Judgment is voluntarily entered into as the result of arm's-length negotiation, and all parties hereto were represented by counsel in deciding to enter into this Consent Decree and Final Judgment.

#### **V. INJUNCTIVE AND OTHER EQUITABLE RELIEF**

Each Participating Manufacturer is permanently enjoined from:

A. Taking any action, directly or indirectly, to target Youth within the State of California in the advertising, promotion or marketing of Tobacco Products, or taking any action the primary purpose of which is to initiate, maintain or increase the incidence of use of Tobacco Products by Youth within the State of California.

B. After 180 days after the STMSA Execution Date, using or causing to be used within the State of California any Cartoon in the advertising, promoting, packaging or labeling of Tobacco Products.

C. After 30 days after the STMSA Execution Date, making or causing to be made any payment or other consideration to any other person or entity to use, display, make reference to or use as a prop within the State of California any Tobacco Product, Tobacco Product package, advertisement for a Tobacco Product, or any other item bearing a Brand Name in any Media; provided, however, that the foregoing prohibition shall not apply to (1) Media where the audience or viewers are within an Adult-Only Facility (provided such Media are not visible to persons outside such Adult-Only Facility); (2) Media not intended for distribution or display to the public; or (3) actions taken by any Participating Manufacturer in connection with a Brand Name Sponsorship permitted pursuant to subsections III(c)(2)(A) and III(c)(2)(B)(i) of the Agreement, and use of a Brand Name to identify a Brand Name Sponsorship permitted by subsection III(c)(2)(B)(ii).

D. Beginning July 1, 1999, marketing, distributing, offering, selling, licensing or causing to be marketed, distributed, offered, sold, or licensed (including, without limitation, by catalogue or direct mail), within the State of California, any apparel or other merchandise (other than Tobacco Products, items the sole function of which is to advertise Tobacco Products, or written or electronic publications) which bears a Brand Name. Provided, however, that nothing in this section shall (1) require any Participating Manufacturer to breach or terminate any

licensing agreement or other contract in existence as of June 20, 1997 (this exception shall not apply beyond the current term of any existing contract, without regard to any renewal or option term that may be exercised by such Participating Manufacturer); (2) prohibit the distribution to any Participating Manufacturer's employee who is not Underage of any item described above that is intended for the personal use of such an employee; (3) require any Participating Manufacturer to retrieve, collect or otherwise recover any item that prior to the STMSA Execution Date was marketed, distributed, offered, sold, licensed or caused to be marketed, distributed, offered, sold or licensed by such Participating Manufacturer; (4) apply to coupons or other items used by Adults solely in connection with the purchase of Tobacco Products; (5) apply to apparel or other merchandise used within an Adult-Only Facility that is not distributed (by sale or otherwise) to any member of the general public; or (6) apply to apparel or other merchandise (a) marketed, distributed, offered, sold, or licensed at the site of a Brand Name Sponsorship permitted pursuant to subsection III(c)(2)(A) or III(c)(2)(B)(i) of the Agreement by the person to which the relevant Participating Manufacturer has provided payment in exchange for the use of the relevant Brand Name in the Brand Name Sponsorship or a third-party that does not receive payment from the relevant Participating Manufacturer (or any Affiliate of such Participating Manufacturer) in connection

with the marketing, distribution, offer, sale or license of such apparel or other merchandise, or (b) used at the site of a Brand Name Sponsorship permitted pursuant to subsections III(c)(2)(A) or III(c)(2)(B)(i) of the Agreement (during such event) that are not distributed (by sale or otherwise) to any member of the general public.

/ / /

E. After seven days after the STMSA Execution Date, distributing or causing to be distributed within the State of California any free samples of Tobacco Products except in an Adult-Only Facility. For purposes of this Consent Decree and Final Judgment, a "free sample" does not include a Tobacco Product that is provided to an Adult in connection with (1) the purchase, exchange or redemption for proof of purchase of any Tobacco Products (including, but not limited to, a free offer in connection with the purchase of Tobacco Products, such as a "two-for-one" offer), or (2) the conducting of consumer testing or evaluation of Tobacco Products with persons who certify that they are Adults.

F. Using or causing to be used as a brand name of any Tobacco Product pursuant to any agreement requiring the payment of money or other valuable consideration, any nationally recognized or nationally established brand name or trade name of any non-tobacco item or service or any nationally recognized or nationally established sports team, entertainment group or individual celebrity. Provided, however, that the preceding sentence shall not apply to any

Tobacco Product brand name in existence as of July 1,1998. For the purposes of this provision, the term "other valuable consideration" shall not include an agreement between two entities who enter into such agreement for the sole purpose of avoiding infringement claims.

G. Entering into any contract, combination or conspiracy with any other Tobacco Product Manufacturer that has the purpose or effect of: (1) limiting competition in the production or distribution of information about health hazards or other consequences of the use of their products; (2) limiting or suppressing research into tobacco and health; or (3) limiting or suppressing research into the marketing or development of new products. Provided, however, that nothing in the preceding sentence shall be deemed to (1) require any Participating Manufacturer to produce, distribute or otherwise disclose any information that is subject to any privilege or protection; (2) preclude any Participating Manufacturer from entering into any joint defense or joint legal interest agreement or arrangement (whether or not in writing), or from asserting any privilege pursuant thereto; or (3) impose any affirmative obligation on any Participating Manufacturer to conduct any research.

H. Making any material misrepresentation of fact regarding the health consequences of using any Tobacco Product, including any tobacco additives or other ingredients. Provided, however, that nothing in the preceding

sentence shall limit the exercise of any First Amendment right or the assertion of any defense or position in any judicial, legislative or regulatory forum.

## **VI. MISCELLANEOUS PROVISIONS**

A. Jurisdiction of this case is retained by the Court for the purposes of implementing, and enforcing the Agreement and this Consent Decree and Final Judgment and enabling the continuing proceedings contemplated herein. Whenever possible, the State of California and the Participating Manufacturers shall seek to resolve any issue that may exist as to compliance with this Consent Decree and Final Judgment by discussion among the appropriate designees named pursuant to subsection XV(n) of the Agreement. The State of California and/or any Participating Manufacturer may apply to the Court at any time for further orders and directions as may be necessary or appropriate for the implementation and enforcement of this Consent Decree and Final Judgment. Provided, however, that with regard to subsections V(A) and V(H) of this Consent Decree and Final Judgment, the Attorney General shall issue a cease and desist demand to the Participating Manufacturer that the Attorney General believes is in violation of either of such sections at least ten Business Days before the Attorney General applies to the Court for an order to enforce such subsections, unless the Attorney General reasonably determines that either a compelling time-sensitive public health and safety concern requires more immediate action or the Court has previously issued an

Enforcement Order to the Participating Manufacturer in question for the same or a substantially similar action or activity. For any claimed violation of this Consent Decree and Final Judgment, in determining whether to seek an order for monetary, civil contempt or criminal sanctions for any claimed violation, the Attorney General shall give good-faith consideration to whether: (1) the Participating Manufacturer that is claimed to have committed the violation has taken appropriate and reasonable steps to cause the claimed violation to be cured, unless that party has been guilty of a pattern of violations of like nature; and (2) a legitimate, good-faith dispute exists as to the meaning of the terms in question of this Consent Decree and Final Judgment. The Court in any case in its discretion may determine not to enter an order for monetary, civil contempt or criminal sanctions.

B. This Consent Decree and Final Judgment is not intended to be, and shall not in any event be construed as, or deemed to be, an admission or concession or evidence of (1) any liability or any wrongdoing whatsoever on the part of any Released Party or that any Released Party has engaged in any of the activities barred by this Consent Decree and Final Judgment; or (2) personal jurisdiction over any person or entity other than the Participating Manufacturers. Each Participating Manufacturer specifically disclaims and denies any liability or wrongdoing whatsoever with respect to the claims and allegations asserted against it in this action, and

has stipulated to the entry of this Consent Decree and Final Judgment solely to avoid the further expense, inconvenience, burden and risk of litigation.

C. Except as expressly provided otherwise in the Agreement, this Consent Decree and Final Judgment shall not be modified (by this Court, by any other court or by any other means) unless the party seeking modification demonstrates, by clear and convincing evidence, that it will suffer irreparable harm from new and unforeseen conditions. Provided, however, that the provisions of sections III, V, VI and VII of this Consent Decree and Final Judgment shall in no event be subject to modification without the consent of the State of California and all affected Participating Manufacturers. In the event that any of the sections of this Consent Decree and Final Judgment enumerated in the preceding sentence are modified by this Court, by any other court or by any other means without the consent of the State of California and all affected Participating Manufacturers, then this Consent Decree and Final Judgment shall be void and of no further effect. Changes in the economic conditions of the parties shall not be grounds for modification. It is intended that the Participating Manufacturers will comply with this Consent Decree and Final Judgment as originally entered, even if the Participating Manufacturers' obligations hereunder are greater than those imposed under current or future law (unless compliance with this Consent Decree and Final Judgment would violate such

law). A change in law that results, directly or indirectly, in more favorable or beneficial treatment of any one or more of the Participating Manufacturers shall not support modification of this Consent Decree and Final Judgment.

D. In any proceeding which results in a finding that a Participating Manufacturer violated this Consent Decree and Final Judgment, the Participating Manufacturer or Participating Manufacturers found to be in violation shall pay the State's costs and attorneys' fees incurred by the State of California in such proceeding.

E. The remedies in this Consent Decree and Final Judgment are cumulative and in addition to any other remedies the State of California may have at law or equity, including but not limited to its rights under the Agreement. Nothing herein shall be construed to prevent the State from bringing an action with respect to conduct not released pursuant to the Agreement, even though that conduct may also violate this Consent Decree and Final Judgment. Nothing in this Consent Decree and Final Judgment is intended to create any right for the State of California to obtain any Tobacco Product formula that it would not otherwise have under applicable law.

F. No party shall be considered the drafter of this Consent Decree and Final Judgment for the purpose of any statute, case law or rule of interpretation or construction that would or might cause any provision to be construed against the drafter. Nothing in this Consent Decree and Final

Judgment shall be construed as approval by the State of California of the Participating Manufacturers' business organizations, operations, acts or practices, and the Participating Manufacturers shall make no representation to the contrary.

G. The settlement negotiations resulting in this Consent Decree and Final Judgment have been undertaken in good faith and for settlement purposes only, and no evidence of negotiations or discussions underlying this Consent Decree and Final Judgment shall be offered or received in evidence in any action or proceeding for any purpose. Neither this Consent Decree and Final Judgment nor any public discussions, public statements or public comments with respect to this Consent Decree and Final Judgment by the State of California or any Participating Manufacturer or its agents shall be offered or received in evidence in any action or proceeding for any purpose other than in an action or proceeding arising under or relating to this Consent Decree and Final Judgment.

H. All obligations of the Participating Manufacturers pursuant to this Consent Decree and Final Judgment (including, but not limited to, all payment obligations) are, and shall remain, several and not joint.

I. The provisions of this Consent Decree and Final Judgment are applicable only to actions taken (or omitted to be taken) within the States. Provided, however, that the preceding sentence shall not be construed as extending the

territorial scope of any provision of this Consent Decree and Final Judgment whose scope is otherwise limited by the terms thereof.

J. Nothing in subsection V(A) or V(H) of this Consent Decree and Final Judgment shall create a right to challenge the continuation, after the STMSA Execution Date, of any advertising content, claim or slogan (other than use of a Cartoon) that was not unlawful prior to the STMSA Execution Date.

K. If the Agreement terminates in this State for any reason, then this Consent Decree and Final Judgment shall be void and of no further effect.

#### **VII. FINAL DISPOSITION**

A. The Agreement, the settlement set forth therein, and the establishment of the Escrow provided for therein are hereby approved in all respects, and all claims are hereby dismissed with prejudice as provided therein.

B. The Court finds that the persons signing the Agreement have full and complete authority to enter into the binding and fully effective settlement of this action as set forth in the Agreement. The Court also finds that the persons signing the Stipulation for Entry of Consent Decree and Final Judgment have full and complete authority to enter into said Stipulation. The Court further finds that entering into this settlement is in the best interests of the State of

California.

C. The Court Clerk is ordered to enter this Consent Decree and Final Judgment forthwith.

Dated: December , 1998

---

RONALD S. PRAGER  
JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT